BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06094359 4

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Brenda Cossman, Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2004-2005

Prepared with the assistance of Andrea Sanche

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Storage
KE
538.5
.C672
2004
v.1
c.1

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Brenda Cossman, Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2004-2005

Prepared with the assistance of Andrea Sanche

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma01coss_3

FAMILY LAW
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Volume I

Page No.

I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents 1
Margrit Eichler, "Beyond the Monolithic Bias in Family Literature," *Families in Canada Today* (Toronto: Gage, 1983) at 3 2
Vanier Institute of the Family, "Definitions of Family," *Profiling Canada's Families* (1994) at 10-11 5
Maureen Baker, "Family Trends and Family Policies," *Transition, Vol. 7*, (December 1993) 6
Vanier Institute of the Family, *Profiling Canada's Families II* (2000) at 30-32; 36-38, 48-49, 182-183 10
Robin Fitzgerald, *Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile* (Statistics Canada, Canadian Centre for Justice Studies, 1999) 15
Janice Drakich and Connie Guberman, "Violence in the Family" 16
Krista Foss, "Men as likely to face abuse from partner, Statscan says," *The Globe and Mail*, 27 June 2002 20

B. Recent Challenges to the Family

Canada (Attorney General) v. Mossop, [1993] 1 S.C.R. 554 22
Egan v. Canada, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 513 30

C. Legal Regulation of the Family

Balfour v. Balfour, [1919] 2 K.B. 571 (C.A.) 33
F. Olsen, "The Family and The Market: A Study of Ideology and Legal Reform" (1983), Harvard L.Rev. 1497 34
John Eekelaar, *Family Law and Social Policy*, 2d ed. (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1984) at 15-26 36
Mary Ann Glendon, *Abortion and Divorce in Western Law* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1987) at 7-9 41

II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

A. The Significance of Marriage

(a) The Social Context of Marriage

Vanier Institute of the Family, *Profiling Canada's Families II* (2000) at 40-41, 44 –45, 50-51 43

(b) The Shifting Legal Significance of Marriage

Sir William Blackstone, *Commentaries on the Laws of England* 46
William Cobbett, *Advice to Young Men and (incidentally) to Young Women* (1837) 46

Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Bigamy* (1985) at 3 47
Hyde v. Hyde (1886), 1 L.R. (P & D) 130 47
Graham v. Graham, 33 F. Supp. 936 (1940) 48
Shelagh Day, "The Charter and Family Law" in Elisabeth Sloss, ed., *Family Law in Canada: New Directions* (Ottawa: Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women, 1985) 27 at 28-30 50
Mary Ann Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property" in J. Eekelaar and S. Katz, eds., *Marriage and Cohabitation in Contemporary Societies* (Toronto: Butterworths, 1978) at 59-70 51

B. Unmarried Cohabitation

Note: Terminology 59
Sarah Schmidt, "The under-30s are choosing common-law", *National Post*, 12 July 2002 59
W. Holland, "Cohabitation and Marriage—A Meeting at the Crossroads?" (1990-1991) 7 *C.F.L.Q.* 33 60
Miron v. Trudel [1995] 2 S.C.R. 418; 124 D.L.R. (4th) 693 65
Molodowich v. Penttinen (1980), 17 R.F.L. (2d) 376 (Ont. Dist. Ct.) 70
Stoikiewicz v. Filas (1978), 7 R.F.L. (2d) 366, 21 O.R. (2d) 717 (U.F.C.) 74
Le Labbe and McCullough (1979), 23 O.R. (2d) 536 (Prov. Ct.) 76
Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act* (1993) 78
M. v. H., [1999] 2 S.C.R. 3 82
Nova Scotia (Attorney General) v. Walsh, [2002] 2 S.C.R. 325 101

C. Validity of Marriage

(a) Overview

H. R. Hahlo, *Nullity of Marriage in Canada* (1979) at 1-5 120
Berend Hovius, Note on Validity of Marriage, ... 120
Peter Hogg, *Constitutional Law of Canada* (1985) at 533-534 121

(b) Opposite Sexes

M.T. v. J.T., 355 A2d 204 (1976). 122
Note: *Littleton v. Prange* 9 S.W. 3d 223 (1999) 128
M. v. M. (1984), 42 R.F.L. (2d) 55, (P.E.I.S.C., Fam. Div.) 128
B. v. A. (1991), 20 R.F.L. (3d) 258 (Ont. S.C.) 129
Note: *C.(L.) v. (C)* (1992), 10 O.R. (3d) 254 (Ont. Gen. Div.) 133
Note: Same-Sex Marriage and The Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships 133
Halpern v. Canada (A.G.) (2002), 60 O.R. (3d) 32 (Ont. Div. Ct.) 135
Halpern v. Canada (A.G.) (2003), 225 D.L.R.(4th) 529 (Ont. C.A.) 147
Note: Same-Sex Marriage in British Columbia, Quebec and the Yukon 162
Note: The Same-Sex Marriage Reference 163
Note: Same-Sex Marriage Developments in the United States 163

(c) Capacity to Consummate

Gajamugan v. Gajamugan (1979), 10 R.F.L. (2d) 280 (Ont. S.C.) 165
Dashevsky v. Dashevsky (1973), 13 R.F.L. 1 (Ont. S.C.) 167

Norman v. Norman (1979), 9 R.F.L. (2d) 235 (Ont. U.F.C.) 170

(d) Monogamy

Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Bigamy* (1985) at 3 171
Note: Bigamous and Polygamous Relationships 172
"Polygamous spouses covered under B.C. family legislation, judge holds" *Lawyer's Weekly*, 1 November 1991 174
"Community practices polygamy" *Globe and Mail*, 24 September 1990 175
"Polygamist Is Found Guilty of Bigamy" *The Washington Post,* 20 May 2001 177

(e) Age Requirements for a Valid Marriage 178

(f) Prohibited Degrees of Consanguinity and Affinity 179

(g) Consent as a Requirement for a Valid Marriage 180

(i) Capacity to Understand

Note: *Durham v. Durham* (!885), 10 P.D. 80 at 81-2 181
David Thompson, "A Consideration of the Mental Capacity Provisions of the Marriage Act in View of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms and *Webb v. Webb*" (1986) Can. Com. L.J. 101 at 101-109 181

(ii) Duress

Scott v. Sebright (1886), 12 P.D. 21; *Cooper v. Crane*, [1891] P. 369; *Buckland v. Buckland*, [1967] 2 All E.R. 300 186
S.(A.) v. S.(A.) (1988), 15 R.F.L. (3d) 433 (Ont. U.F.C.) 187
Note on Arranged Marriages: *Parihar v. Bhattie* (1980), 17 R.F.L. (2d) 289; *Singh v. Singh* (unreported, Ont. U. Fam. Ct., 13 June 1980) 192
Bruce Ziff, "Recent Developments in Marriage and Divorce" (1986) 18 Ottawa Law Review 121 at 133-134 192
David Bradley, "Duress and Arranged Marriages" (1983) 46 Modern Law Review 499 193

(iii) Limited Purpose Marriage

Asser v. Permohamed (1984), 40 R.F.L. (2d) 299 (Ont. H.C.) 195
Note: *Singla v. Singla* (1985), 46 R.F.L. (2d) 235 (N.S.S.C.) 197

III. DIVORCE

A. The Social Context of Divorce

Ann Marie Ambert, "Divorce: Facts, Figures, and Consequences" (Vanier Institute of the Family, 1998) 199
Statistics Canada, "Divorces 2001 and 2002," *The Daily*, May 4, 2004 210
Julien D. Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crises on Marriage Breakdown" (1989), 20 *R.G.D.* 109 214

B. Reform of Divorce Law

(a) The Movement to No-Fault Divorce

H. R. Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce" in R.S. Abella and

C. L'Heureux-Dubé, eds., *Family Law: Dimensions of Justice* (1983).....216
Note on history of divorce legislation in Canada.....219
Bruce Ziff, "Recent Developments in Canadian Law: Marriage and Divorce" (1986) 18 Ottawa Law Review 121 at 137-147.....219
Dept. Of Justice, *Evaluation of the Divorce Act, Phase II: Monitoring and Evaluation* (May, 1990) at 1-9.....223
Note: Divorce Reform in England.....228

(b) Critiques of No-Fault Divorce

Lenore J. Weitzman, *The Divorce Revolution* (1985) at 362.....228
Marygold Melli, "Constructing a Social Problem: The Post-Divorce Plight of Women and Children" [1986] *American Bar Foundation Research Journal* 759 at 770-771.....232
Note: Other Critiques of No-Fault Divorce.....233
"Putting the 'fault' back in no-fault divorce" *Globe and Mail,* 15 March 1988.....235
"Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?" *Lawyer's Weekly*, 25 March 1988.....236
Note: *Valenti v. Valenti* (1996), 21 R.F.L. (4th) 246 (Ont. Gen. Div.).....238

C. Obtaining a Divorce Under the Divorce Act, 1985

(a) Grounds for Divorce

(i) Living Separate and Apart

Rushton v. Rushton (1968), 66 W.W.R. 764, 2 D.L.R. (3d) 25 (B.C.S.C.).....239
Dupere v. Dupere (1974), 19 R.F.L. 270, 9 N.B.R. (2d) 554 (Q.B.).....239
Calvert v. Calvert (1997), 32 O.R. 281 (Ont. Gen. Div.).....242
Note: Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division.....242
Note: Alternative to Separation as a "No-Fault" Ground for Divorce.....242

(ii) Adultery

Note on Definition of Adultery.....243
"Wisconsin woman to stand trial on rarely used adultery charge" *The Globe and Mail,* 1 May 1990.....243
Burbage v. Burbage (1985), 46 R.F.L. (2d) 33 (Ont. H.C.J.) at 36-38.....244
Note: *d'Entremont v. d'Entremont* (1992), 44 R.F.L. (3d) 224 (N.S.C.A.).....245

(iii) Cruelty

Knoll v. Knoll, [1970] 2 O.R. 169, 1 R.F.L. 141 (C.A.).....245
Note on test for cruelty; *Chouinard v. Chouinard* (1969), 10 D.L.R. (3d) 263 (N.B.C.A.).....248
Austin v. Austin (1970), 2 R.F.L. 136, 73 W.W.R. 289, (Sask. C.A.).....248
Gilbert v. Gilbert (1980), 18 R.F.L. (2d) 240, 39 N.S.R. (2d) 241 (T.D.).....249
B.(Y.) v. B.(J.) (1989), 20 R.F.L. (3d) 154 (Alta. Q.B.).....253

(b) Duties and Bars to Proceedings

(i) Condonation, Connivance, Collusion

Christine Davies, *Family Law in Canada* (1986) at 417-437.....255
Johnston v. Ahmed (1981), 22 R.F.L. (2d) 14 (Alta. Q.B.).....258

(ii) Inadequate Provision for Child Support

Note; *F. (R.D.) v. F. (S.L.)* (1987), 6 R.F.L. (3d) 413 (B.C.S.C.); *Harper v. Harper* (1999), 78 D.L.R. (4th) 548 (Ont. Gen. Div.) 260

(iii) Religious Bars

"Family Lawyers Get Change" *Law Times*, 1990 261

IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN

A. The Economics of Marriage

Vanier Institute of the Family, *Profiling Canada's Families II* (2000) at 144-145 263

Statistics Canada, *Women in Canada 2000* 264

B. The Economic Consequences of Divorce

Vanier Institute of the Family, *Profiling Canada's Families II* (2000) at 114-117 274

Note: The Economic Consequences of Divorce 276

Cristin Schmitz, "Women suffer financially post-divorce while men benefit: Statscan study" *The Lawyers Weekly*, May 16, 1997 277

Cristin Schmitz, "Family law reform can't solve divorce poverty?" *The Lawyer's Weekly*, September 28, 1990. 279